

FM REVIEW 2014 30 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This submission consists of 3 poems by the author, describing respectively a hospital stairwell, CHF/renal insufficiency, and a friend's grief. They all contain some beautiful lines and images, but are quite inconsistent. One reviewer liked them all quite a bit; while another with more background critiquing poetry felt they needed a lot of work. I think the poem about the metaphor for congestive heart failure is the easiest to access and most relevant to medical educators. I recommend the author revise this poem, and add an explanatory footnote about how he's used this metaphor with the patient.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: These 3 poems all contain some well-crafted lines and eye-catching images. The poem that fits most closely with the mission and purpose of this journal is "X" We would like to ask you to revise this poem slightly and resubmit.

Specifically, please consider the following concerns:

1) Since the title refers to CHF and chronic renal insufficiency, it is somewhat confusing to refer to "the first" and "the second." After awhile it becomes clear you are referring to the heart and the kidney, but this is not immediately apparent because of the title. Maybe change the title to simply "Heart and Kidneys"?

2) Reviewer 1 does not feel yin/yang accurately describes the relationship of heart and kidneys. I'm not so sure. Heart and kidneys, like yin and yang, seem complementary. They are not "opposites" of course, which is how many think of these terms. Please think about whether the allusion to yin and yang is appropriate given the organs you're talking about.

3) Lines 5 and 6 read and rhyme awkwardly. What about this revision:

Now late in their voyage, as tides rise round,

the second's sick with thirst while the first slowly drowns.

4) Since you are using punctuation in this poem, consider making the "the" in line 6 lower case, as well as the "this" in line 8, following conventional sentence structure.

5) Your note of explanation regarding this metaphor is fascinating. Especially if you change the title as suggested, please add a brief explanatory note to be published with the poem that shares how you used this metaphor with your patient.

We regret that we are not able to use the other two poems, although as noted each has merit.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR II: This is a charming little poem, I think. I recommend that we accept it for publication, as the author has made all the changes requested, and it reads very well. I hope we can

also publish the explanatory note, as the way in which the author used these metaphors with his patient really enriches the meaning of the poem itself.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II: Thank you for these changes. The poem reads really well, and the explanation provides additional richness (loved the Lorelei image!).